



MINUTES
CITY OF LAKE WORTH BEACH
HISTORIC RESOURCES PRESERVATION BOARD REGULAR MEETING
CITY HALL COMMISSION CHAMBER
WEDNESDAY, JULY 12, 2023 -- 6:09 PM

ROLL CALL and RECORDING OF ABSENCES: Present were- Robert D'Arinzo -Acting Chair; Jamie Foreman; Tricia Hallison-Mischler; Nadine Heitz. Also present were – Yeneneh Terefe, Preservation Planner; Anne Greening, Senior Preservation Planner; Erin Sita, Assistant Director for Community Sustainability; Elizabeth Lenihan, Board Attorney (virtual); Sherie Coale, Board Secretary.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

ADDITIONS / DELETIONS / REORDERING AND APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA None

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: Available at next meeting

CASES

SWEARING IN OF STAFF AND APPLICANTS Board Secretary administered oath to those wishing to give testimony.

PROOF OF PUBLICATION

- 1) HRPB 23-01500004 -1115 North Ocean Breeze
HRPB 23-01500005 -1106 South Palmway
HRPB 23-01500006 - 231 South J Street

WITHDRAWALS / POSTPONEMENTS None

CONSENT None

PUBLIC HEARINGS:

BOARD DISCLOSURE None

UNFINISHED BUSINESS:

- A. HRPB #23-00100084:** Additional information requested by the HRPB at the June 14, 2023 meeting on the proposed replacement of an existing metal shingle roof with asphalt shingles at 722 North K Street.

Staff: A. Greening reminds Board of details of previous Board meeting direction including additional information from staff on the quantity of metal shingle roofs in the City, the visual impact of replacement with asphalt shingles or standing seam versus metal shingles. Also requested from the applicant was cost quotes for asphalt shingle replacement and metal shingle replacement.

Staff did not have the capacity to engage in a full-study/survey of metal shingled roofs in the City but did find at least 15 in the Historic districts.

Applicant: Tom Turner – As the owner/investor he is attempting to keep the property affordable for a purchaser. It is an investment property and not homesteaded. States there is no economic hardship.

Board: As it isn't a homesteaded property, the Board does not believe the asphalt shingle is the best solution.

Applicant: He was told that the metal shingle roof is the most costly of roofs.

Staff: The Office of the State of Florida Secretary of the Interior's Standards has provided their opinion on the replacement of that type of roof which is: Like for like is preferable, secondly a light grey asphalt shingle mimicking the horizontality and color of a metal shingle on a case by case basis with accompanying Economic Hardship application to justify the alternative material. Standing seam or 5V crimp are not options according to the Office of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. This guidance was confirmed in 2016 and reaffirmed in July 2023.

Staff reminds Board that the decisions made impact the Certified Local Government status for the entire City. This allows for district waivers to flood map requirements and variances to Historic properties as well as a reduced Flood Insurance rates for the entire City, not solely Historic properties.

Motion: T. Hallison-Mischler moves to deny HRPB 23-00100084 as the applicant has not established by competent substantial evidence that replacement with metal shingles is infeasible or that the application is compliant with the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations and Historic Preservation requirements; J. Foreman 2nd.

Vote: Ayes 3, Nay 1-R.D'Arinzo dissenting. Motion carries.

NEW BUSINESS:

- A. HRPB Project Number 23-01500004:** A request for three variances to allow a shed and pavers exceeding the maximum impermeable surface coverage, as well as to allow a shade sail structure in the required setback and exceeding the maximum accessory structure coverage at 1115 North Ocean Breeze. The subject property is a contributing resource within the Northeast Lucerne Historic District and is located in the Single Family Residential (SFR) zoning district. The future land use designation is the Single Family Residential (SFR).

Staff: A. Greening presents case findings and analysis. A shed, pavers and shade sail were all installed without permits. The maximum surface coverage has been exceeded as well as the maximum accessory structure coverage. Between 2015 and 2018 large areas of the backyard were paved without permits resulting in an overage of +/- 645 square feet. The shade sail is located within the side setback area. The property was cited for work without permits in October 2022 with the permits being submitted on February 9, 2023 and disapproved on February 16. A re-submittal on April 17, 2023 was also disapproved. The one citation for a gate permit was unable to be processed as the location required the use of a neighbor's property for the residents to 1115 N. Ocean Breeze to access a parking space. Staff met with the applicant and advised to remove pavers and sail shade to bring the property into compliance but the applicant chose to move forward with requests for variances. The shade sail as attached to the heightened poles at the fence are encroaching in the setback as it is considered a structure. If the shade sail were to be attached to a tree it would not require a permit provided the overhang did not exceed two1/2 feet.

Board: Would it be possible to retro-fit to contain the drainage? Staff advises the variances would need to be granted followed by engineered drawings, it would be easier to remove the pavers and install semi-permeable pavers.

Applicant: States he would remove the concrete under the shade sail; presents photos of property.

Staff will work with the applicant if they are willing to remove other portions of concrete to reduce the impermeable coverage. Stormwater runoff is a very real concern for contiguous properties and lack of permeable area for percolation.

Public Comment: Board members were provided with three written public comments prior to the start of the meeting. All comments were in support of the proposals made by the applicant.

Motion: N. Heitz moves to approve HRPB 23-01500004 for one of three variances to allow adjustment to the maximum impermeable surface to accommodate the shed only; J. Foreman 2nd.

Board Attorney advises to clearly state the criteria: The shed is a reasonable expectation for a single-family home. Allowing for the variance will not create a need for a revision to the historic structure.

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous.

B. HRPB Project Number 23-01500006: A request for a variance to allow the installation of a shed between the principal structure and the public street at 231 South J Street. The subject property is a non-contributing resource within the Southeast Lucerne Historic District and is located in the Multi-Family Residential (MF-20) zoning district. The future land use designation is Medium Density Residential (MDR).

Staff: A. Greening presents case findings and analysis. The new shed will be in the same location as the old shed. The rear setbacks are approximately four (4) feet and the side setbacks are approximately 1.5 feet, there isn't anywhere else to locate the shed. Staff recommends approval of the request.

Motion: T. Hallison-Mischler moves to approve HRPB 23-01500006 with staff recommended Conditions of Approval as the application meets the variance criteria based on the data and analysis within the staff report; N. Heitz 2nd.

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous

C. HRPB Project Number 23-01500005: A request for three variances to allow a gravel boat storage area in front of the front building line, which also exceeds the maximum impermeable surface coverage and does not meet the minimum front yard landscaped area requirements at 1106 South Palmway. The subject property is a non-contributing resource within the South Palm Park Historic District and is located in the Single Family Residential (SFR) zoning district. The future land use designation is the Single Family Residential (SFR).

Staff: A. Greening explains the previous review processes, which were administrative in nature and ceased in 2018; the approval did not run with the property. This formal process is what remains since a 2018 LDR text change. Storage of the boat forward of the front building line and gravel have increased the non-conformities of the existing excess impermeable surface coverage and landscaping. Non-conformities may exist as is however they may not be increased. Variances are the result of unpermitted work. Although a double frontage lot is unusual, many homes in South Palm Park have the same condition, the strict application of the LDR's would not deprive the owner of reasonable use of the property. The final criteria is met as the use as proposed would not be injurious to the public welfare.

Applicants: Edmund and Theresa Deveaux-The gravel beneath the boat is off to the side and is less than 60 square feet. Beneath the gravel is a membrane and landscape rock for drainage. New landscape material (Clusia) has been installed for screening, cannot be seen from the east or west. To park on the south side would require the moving of a fence, building an enclosure and entry to the sidewalk. This would have the least impact. Just to the north is a City greenspace, this is protecting the applicant property from flooding occurring on that City lot.

Staff: The impermeable surface coverage has been exceeded in the front yard. The lot is visible from three (3) sides.

Board: The Board does not wish to set a precedent with the approval instead preferring the City to set a policy regarding boats in the front yard. 54:11

Public Comment: None

Motion: J. Foreman moves to approve HRPB 23-01500005 for three (3) variances with staff recommended conditions including: These variances shall continue until the subject property is renovated

to an extent of more than fifty (50) percent of the assessed value of the structure as determined by the building official; Shall only apply to a boat sized equal or smaller to this boat 24 feet in length x8 feet wide x5.5 in height and shall not run in perpetuity. N. Heitz 2nd.

Within 30 days a landscape permit shall be submitted to demonstrate how the substrate will be maintained to stay out of the right-of-way and storm water systems, remain intact; not be expanded. Further, regarding the variance criteria, Board finds the lot to be unique in that it is visible from three (3) sides, the testimony that it would be cost prohibitive and difficult to locate elsewhere on the lot; the substrate would drain and not contribute to the stormwater runoff issue.

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous

D. HRPB Project Number 23-00100141: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the conversion of a detached carport to an enclosed storage space at 809 North Ocean Breeze. The subject property is located in the Single Family Residential (SFR) zoning district and has a future land use designation of Single Family Residential (SFR). The property is a contributing resource in the Northeast Lucerne Historic District.

Staff: A. Greening presents case findings and analysis of the proposal for this contributing structure. On November 15, 2022 the City issued a Stop Work Order for work without permit. Staff has met with the applicant to discuss design revisions. The visual appearance would be affected by loss of the opening, a character-defining feature of a Mid-Century Modern style home. A suggestion is to build the walls behind the existing structural elements so it would harken back to the carport entrance.

Applicant: Sue Carstens agrees with the Conditions of Approval proposed by staff.

Board: Have the conditions already been met or are they in progress? **Response:** A permit was submitted with review pending the outcome of this meeting.

Board: Members like the idea of recessing the wall; staff suggests articulation in the form of a reveal for the stucco. Addition of Condition #9 – a stucco reveal shall be added to indicate the location of the carport.

Public Comment: None

Motion: N. Heitz moves to approve HRPB 23-00100141 with staff recommended Conditions based upon competent substantial evidence in the staff report and pursuant to the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations and Historic Preservation requirements plus one additional Condition #9 - A stucco reveal shall be added to indicate the location of the carport; T. Hallison-Mischler 2nd.

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous.

E. HRPB Project Number 23-00100138: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for roof replacement at 623 North Ocean Breeze. The subject property is a contributing resource to the Old Lucerne National Historic District and is located in the Single Family Residential (SFR) Zoning District.

Staff: A. Greening provides details and reminds Board that metal standing seam/5V crimp is not in the State of Florida guidance. The patterning of the roof material is extremely important in determining the building's overall historic character. Replacement in-kind is best and if not feasible or a hardship then a shingle roof resembling the original color and shape is recommended.

Applicant: Does not think it is reasonable to expect someone to spend double the cost for a metal shingle roof.

Board: Discusses if there could be an economic hardship and whether the applicant will be willing. Cost wise it appears the asphalt shingle roof is the least expensive followed by the standing seam roof and the lastly the metal shingle. Although the applicant states he is amenable to the asphalt shingle as opposed to the metal shingle, Board would like to be able to determine that there is a hardship before considering the asphalt shingle.

Motion: Continuance until next meeting J. Foreman T. Hallison-Mischler 2nd. The applicant was advised to call to schedule a meeting with staff for further discussion.

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous

F. HRPB Project Number 23-00100129: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for construction of a new structure, to be used as a garage, office, and dwelling unit, at 122 North L Street. The subject property is a contributing resource to the Northeast Lucerne Historic District and is located in the Mixed Use – East (MU-E) Zoning District.

Staff: A. Greening the garage on-site has been condemned. The proposed new structure has a two (2) bedroom unit with garage and office beneath. The impermeable surface is slightly over the allowed amount. It is visually compatible with surrounding buildings. To bring more minimal traditional style, staff suggests siding or stucco to imitate siding and asphalt shingle instead of standing seam. The blank facades on the north and west elevations can receive windows or faux shutters.

Board: The applicants are not present for the meeting.

Motion: N. Heitz moves to approve HRPB 23-00100129 with staff recommended Conditions based upon the competent substantial evidence in the staff report and pursuant to the City of Lake worth Beach Land Development Regulations and Historic Preservation requirements; T. Hallison-Mischler 2nd.

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous.

G. HRPB Project Number 23-00100118 Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for window and door replacement at the property located at 1102 North Lakeside Drive; PCN #38-43-44-21-15-360-0010. The subject property is a contributing resource to the Northeast Lucerne Local Historic District and is located in the Single-Family Residential (SFR) Zoning District.

Staff: Y. Terefe – The selected windows for the proposed replacements were inappropriate with the COA application. In the interim, the applicant agreed to add muntins to most windows but wished to bring the question regarding the paired sliding glass doors to the Board. The structure is a contributing structure and the doors are visible from two streets. The Design Guidelines specify that openings should not be enlarged or filled in but utilize the original openings. Door openings

Robert Huss (General Contractor) for the applicant: the owners received a variance approval for a pool. Owners are proposing the muntins to be on the inside. With a pool fence and landscaping, the sliders would not be visible.

Staff: The muntins, according to Guidelines, shall be exterior raised muntins.

Public Comment: None

Board: There will be a drastic change in appearance to the lot.

Motion: N. Heitz moves to approve HRPB 23-00100118 with staff recommended Conditions of Approval including the requirement for raised, exterior muntins and window openings 9-12 be sliding glass doors; based upon competent substantial evidence in the staff report and pursuant to the city of Lake worth Beach Land Development Regulations and Historic Preservation requirements; T. Hallison- Mischler 2nd.

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous.

H. HRPB Project Number 23-00100149: Consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to demolish the front of the principal structure to allow for the construction of a new front addition, to construct a new rear addition, to increase the total building lot coverage through the Sustainable Bonus Incentive Program, and to convert an existing garage to a cabana at 1405 South Palmway. The subject property is a contributing resource to the South Palm Park District and is located in the Single-Family Residential (SFR) Zoning District.

Staff: Y. Terefe reviews project details and provides case analysis and history of property renovations. Also recommended by staff is that the cabana/garage conversion could, with changes to the plans, bring the cabana into compliance. Additions to the front structure should be considered separate from the cabana. The property owner was issued a stop work order in mid-December 2022 for no permits after multiple meetings with staff to discuss the proposed plans for the property. Staff received a completed

COA on June 16, 2023 for the proposed work. The applicant is proposing to utilize the Sustainable Bonus Incentive Program to account for excess structure coverage. The conversion of the garage to cabana creates a parking deficit despite the addition of a proposed space in the front yard. The setbacks for homes on the street are all the same and creates a rhythm. Staff contends there is sufficient space to the rear of the primary structure allowing for an addition as well as a pool while retaining the front façade.

Applicant: Is in agreement with separating the requests as well as providing the requested distinction offered by leaving recesses to indicate the location of the garage doors. Would like an area for children and dog to play. Does not want to remove the older trees on the lot along the rear property line. Discusses the removal of front façade elements originally on the house.

Public Comment: Board members were provided with eleven written public comments prior to the start of the meeting. All comments were in support of the proposals made by the applicant.

Motion: N. Heitz moves to approve a portion of HRPB 23-00100149 for conversion of the existing garage to a cabana with Conditions based upon the competent substantial evidence in the staff report and pursuant to the City of Lake Worth Beach Land Development Regulations and Historic Preservation requirements; J. Foreman 2nd.

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous.

Motion: J. Foreman moves to table the new construction portion of the project; N. Heitz 2nd.

Vote: Ayes all, unanimous.

-----5-minute break-----2:14:30

Conceptual Review of the project: Staff suggests a 2-story addition to the rear of the house would eliminate the need for the front addition. If the pool were to be shifted slightly north, the addition could accommodate a stairwell and 2nd floor. A 2nd floor would be a good compromise and preserve the façade of the front structure.

Applicant Is concerned about the trees on the lot and the pool must be where it is shown. Applicant states that her compromise is that she would do anything and the house has had so many changes in the past and nothing historic remains as it lost a lot of pieces.

Staff and Board remind the applicant that the loss of the front façade would render the property non-contributing. The Ordinance is about preserving the original aspects of the structure and property. The historic fabric of the house would be destroyed. Although the applicant states they would re-create, it is not the same as the original and would create a false sense of history.

Greg Richter 1202 S. Palmway– This makes sense, they want to bring the look forward. Removing the oaks would affect the neighborhood. This is common sense. The second floor would involve neighbors.

Staff: Nothing has been done to the house that is irreversible. Original windows, doors, roof can all be restored. Discussion about guest quarters, bathroom, laundry, office (no kitchen). Staff can meet to review other design options allowing for more square footage and accommodations without removing the front façade.

Applicant asks about pool in front yard; staff states there would be no hardship to support as there is sufficient space in the backyard for a pool.

PLANNING ISSUES: None

PUBLIC COMMENTS: (3-minute limit)

DEPARTMENT REPORTS: None

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS: None

ADJOURNMENT 8:45 PM